

PAPER NO. 455

THIRD IRBD HIGHWAY PROJECT

BY

ENGR.E.I. JOHRI

B.Sc. Engg. (Civil) F.I.E.(Pak), M.ASCE Regd. P. E.

General Manager, National Engineering Services (Pak) Ltd.

NESPAK Highway Division

THIRD IRBD HIGHWAY PROJECT

By

(*)

Engr. E. I. Johri

1. INTRODUCTION

Third IRBD Highway Project in Pakistan was initiated in 1973 after the visit of Appraisal Mission of the World Bank who selected tentatively 15 road stretches. In October/November, 1976 it was mutually decided to prepare an economic feasibility study of 1634 K.M. of roads out of which, sections of roads, showing acceptable economic returns or internal rate of return and benefit/ cost ratios would be selected for detailed design.

2. FEASIBILITY STUDIES

The project was divided into six sections each of which was entrusted to the six local consultants engaged for the project. An advisory consultants, M/s. Louis Berger Inc. USA was employed with the mutual agreement of the Government of Pakistan and the World Bank to coordinate the work of the local consultants. Economic feasibility was completed by September, 1977. In November-December, 1977 a pre-appraisal Mission of the Bank visited Pakistan and reviewed the feasibility reports. After appraising the feasibility studies and in consultation with the Government of Pakistan a length of 832 K.M. of road stretches were selected for detailed design.

Economic & Technical feasibility study was carried out for the following lengths of roads in different provinces of

* B.Sc Engg. (Civil), F.I.E. (Pak), M.ASCE Regd.P.E.
General Manager, National Engineering Services (Pak) Ltd.
NESPAK Highway Division.

E.I. Johri

Pakistan in 1977 :

<u>PROVINCE</u>	<u>LENGTH IN KMS</u>
Punjab	627
Sind	570
Baluchistan	160
NWFP	223
Azad Kashmir	54

Grand Total: 1634 Kms

A map of Pakistan is attached.

3. DETAILED DESIGN

Detailed engineering design of the selected road stretches (total length 832 Kms) was started in February, 1978. The six local consultants continued to design the sections selected out of feasibility studies conducted by them earlier. The work was completed in November, 1978.

Detailed studies of the following roads were carried out :

Lahore - Okara - Khanewal	267 Kms
Okara - Dipalpur	25 "
Hyderabad - Nawab Shah	83 "
Nawab Shah - Khairpur	241 "
Rohri - Reti	126 "
Khairabad - Peshawar	63 "
Peshawar - Charsadda	27 "
Total 832 Kms of roads.	

For the present Lahore - Okara - Khanewal Highway rehabilitation project is being discussed in detail.

Existing conditions of the highway were studied and following were observed :

3.1 General

The Lahore - Khanewal project road is 267 kms long. It is a rehabilitation project.

The project road was divided into three sections viz:

- i) Lahore - Pattoko Section (11.281 - 66 kms).
The start is near Radio Pakistan Station No.2.
- ii) Pattoko - Sahiwal Section (66-149 kms).
- iii) Sahiwal - Khanewal Section (149-267.271 kms, project end point). The project end point is near Khanewal (Milestone 175).

AASHTO standard and Highway Capacity Manual have been generally followed in all the design except limitations imposed due to financial constraints, major being

- a) Urban - areas having acute/sharp curves. No bye-passes are to be provided.
- b) Existing curves of 65 Kph are to remain as they are.
- c) Structures are not to be touched for want of geometric requirements such as roadway widths etc., or re-alignment for improvement purposes.
- d) Dual carriageway, though justified in Lahore - Okara section is not to be considered.

and other deficiencies have been observed.

The general rideability is very poor with P.S.I. of less than 2.

3.2.4 Structures

There are 392 irrigation and drainage structures, out of which there are 24 bridges and 368 culverts of various types. 14 culverts are structurally unsound. 52 culverts are redundant, which are no longer in use. Instead, new culverts closeby have been either constructed or available now.

Superstructures of two bridges have been found to be unsound.

Many bridges are quite narrow. A few bridges have been found to be 4.4 metres wide only.

Several culverts are found to be silted up.

Several culverts/bridges need minor repairs such as parapet walls, wingwalls, railings etc.

3.2.5 Traffic

The project road is having high traffic volume. Refer to Table-1 which indicates the AADT in 1977 and 1992 for non-motorized and motorized traffic.

Traffic forecast is at full growth rate. The AADT in 1977 varies from 3549 to 2610 and AADT in 1992 is estimated to be from 10116 to 4537 in various links of the project road.

3.2.6 Loadometer Studies

Many loadometer studies have been carried out. Average loadings have been worked out for loaded/empty trucks and buses as given below :

<u>Category</u>	<u>Max.</u>	<u>Min.</u>	<u>Average</u>
Loaded Trucks	45000 lbs.	25000 lbs.	34535
Empty	13290	10850	12132
Buses	26100	25900	25000

The average percentage rear axle weight is 72% with a range of 67-78%.

3.3 Recommendations

- i) Lahore to Okara (11.281 - 111 kms) need a four lane divided highway. However, due to financial constraints, two-lane highway is designed for initial construction as an improvement of the existing carriageway.
- ii) The highway cross-section recommended is a two-lane carriageway having 7.3 metres paved widths, two meters untreated shoulders on either side.
- iii) Generally highway curves have been designed for 80 Kph. No improvement in horizontal alignment has been carried out in urban areas. In rural areas the existing curves which are found to be adequate for 65 Kph or more have been left untouched.
- iv) General grade-raise is recommended throughout, varying from 0.5 to 1.2 meters above natural

surface level to the bottom of sub-base.

4. PAVEMENT STRUCTURAL DESIGN

4.1 General

Pavement structural design is based on a number of factors, the major being the subgrade soils strength, the traffic loading and the environmental conditions besides the type, quality and quantity of available construction materials etc.

Based on the laboratory test data on the construction and foundation materials and subject to the environmental conditions, the pavement structure has been designed by following "AASHTO Interim Guide" for design of pavement structures 1972 to meet the anticipated equivalent traffic axles loading. Alternative designs using Road Note 29 have also been calculated and compared with AASHTO, Interim Guide designs.

Economic study for various design alternatives have been made. Comparisons between tripple-surface treatment and asphalt concrete surfacing as well as stage-construction involving overlays etc. to arrive at an economical solution have been carried out.

It was established in the soils and pavement foundation evaluation that no overlay on the existing pavement structure is feasible, and pavement design for Lahore - Bhai Pheru section is discussed in detail.

4.2. Traffic

Based on the loadometer studies, the total gross

weight of trucks and Buses alongwith the axle load distribution was determined. Equivalent 18 kips standard axles load applications have been worked out for the various anticipated traffic volumes (ADT), using AASHTO factors. These equivalent standard axles are computed for 10 and 20 year periods.

Also time period has been deduced whereby three (3) million equivalent standard 18 kip single axle load applications are achieved.

These computations are attached as APPENDIX-1, 2,3 & 4. The loadmeter studies conducted are given in APPENDIX-11.

4.3 Soil Support Value

Ninety percentile value of CBR for the subgrade soils has been adopted as design CBR value. Two design values are used viz. 3% and 7% according to the type of material.

The design CBR values were converted to soil support value (s) as given by a correlation in the AASHTO Interim Guide for Design of Pavement Structures 1972. This is shown plotted on the nomograph attached (see FIGURE-1).

4.4 Regional Factor

The AASHTO design envisages adjustment of the design structural number of pavement as per the climatic conditions. The project road receives annual rainfall of more than 250 mm of rain ranging between 150 mm in Multan to 450 mm in Lahore. The area lies in flat

terrain with poor drainage pattern. A regional factor of "1" has been used for the design purposes.

4.5 Structural Number

Under AASHIO procedure of pavement design, the pavement structural elements are required to produce a minimum structural strength designated by structural number, called "SN". This "SN" is related to the traffic loading and the underlying soil subgrade strength.

The AASHIO monograph used for the design is shown in FIGURE-1 for a serviceability index of 2.5.

Total equivalent 18 kips single axle load applications relevant to the road section under design, are used to read off the structural number (SN) from the monograph. This gives the minimum requirement of the SN.

4.6 Layer Coefficients

The pavement structural elements provide individually a certain strength which makes up the resisting structural number. This depends on the type of materials, its grading used, and construction practices amongst others. The project pavement envisage following elements which may be used in various combinations. Layer-coefficients per centimeter thickness are given below :

i)	Asphalt Concrete Surfacing	0.173
ii)	Tripple Surface Treatment	0.055
iii)	Asphaltic Base	0.134
iv)	Granular Base	0.055
v)	Sub-base	0.047
vi)	Improved subgrade	0.031

This would help in better construction procedures. It will be seen that this approach has resulted in adjusting the top surface course thickness in the various reaches. Also, the design of the underlying pavement elements is done with a view of subsequent overlays to meet the traffic loading requirements for 20 year period without affecting the change in them. For overlay purposes, the total SN is determined relevant to the 20 year design period and deduction made from this of the SN provided initially for 10 years traffic. This gives the net SN which is provided for in the form of asphaltic overlay.

The computation tables also give the thicknesses of various components of pavement structure calculated by employing Road Note 29 method for comparison purposes. It would be observed that the AASHTO method gives the pavement components comparable to Road Note 29. The graphs used for Road Note 29 method are shown in FIGURE-2 & 3.

In the design analysis, improved - subgrade has been envisaged with a minimum CBR of 10% or more. The improved subgrade would consist of local soil and sand mix with or without brick ballast crushed; or any similar materials like blend of screening from quarry with Chenab river sand etc. This would result in considerable savings in the cost of the pavement. For design, soil support value comparable to CBR of 10 is obtained. Minimum design "SN" for the pavement thickness over the improved subgrade has been determined. The net difference between the two design "SN" requirements, namely

the one with improved subgrade, and the other without improved subgrade soils gives the thickness of improved subgrade when divided by its layer coefficient. For the pavement design, the minimum structural number requirements for each element has been considered.

4.8 Economics of Pavement Design

Two major methods have been compared for economic comparison; viz:

- A) Method 1; Using Asphalt Concrete Surfacing.
- B) Method 2; Using tripple-surface treatment for first 3 million standard 18 kip axle loads and then overlaying with Asphalt Concrete.

Cost per kilometer of the pavement and the resultant relevant elements has been worked out for each method. This cost is shown in Table-1 & 10 for subgrade CBR of 3% and 7%, attached at the end of the chapter.

4.9 Pavement Strengthening

A study has been made to see the feasibility of strengthening existing pavement. The main aim was to know as to whether the existing pavement could be used without tearing it apart.

According to soils and pavement evaluation the existing subgrade density is less than 87%. For design purposes, CBR value has been read off the AASHTO CBR3 point curve at this density (generally 90% density was available, which has been adopted as such). The design

CBR value is given as 1%. Design computations for the pavement gives a total thickness of 104 cms including the existing pavement thickness of 17.5 cms.

4.10 Economic analysis has been carried out between the two pavement treatments viz:

1. Method 1. Using Asphalt concrete surfacing in the initial stage for a 10 year period. Other elements of the pavement structures are designed in such a way that only asphaltic overlay is required after the initial ten (10) years for the next 10 year traffic projection i.e. an overall 20 year design period.
2. Method 2. Using tripple-surface treatment surfacing in the initial stage for a period covering three (3) million equivalent 18 kips single axle load applications. After this period, asphaltic overlay is laid to meet the traffic loading requirements for the first ten (10) year period as in method 1 above. Subsequently another asphaltic overlay is placed similar to method 1 in 1992 for the overall 20 year design period.

The assumptions for the economic analyses are:

- a) The cost of first asphaltic overlay in case of method 2, after passing 3 million equivalent standard axles, has been escalated at 15% keeping in view the escalation in the cost of construction inputs as per Nespak survey.

The cost is then discounted at 12 percent to get its present worth.

- b) Construction progress per day is expected to be 1.2 kilometer, assuming nine months' construction period in a year for these sections. Effects like deceleration stoppages, and slow movement of traffic is to be accounted for.
- c) A stoppage of twenty (20) minutes is assumed when overlay is in progress.
- d) Interest rate is taken as 12% per annum.

For pavement designs with subgrade- CBR value of 3% the cost of construction per kilometer of the two methods is shown in Table-FIVE-1.

Cost due to overlay - disturbance in fuel, depreciation, time etc. is shown in TABLE-FIVE 2 and 3 for 10 and 20 year design period. TABLE-FIVE 4 & 5 shows the comparative vehicle user cost for 10 year and 20 year period. TABLE-FIVE-6 & 7 shows the cost due to stoppage-time for 10 & 20 year period. Vehicle user cost is also added up to arrive at the net cost due to these two items. The escalation at 15% and discounting at 12% is shown, linkwise as well.

TABLE-FIVE 8 & 9 sums up the above figures and gives the comparison of cost between the two methods, for subgrade CBR values of 3%, for 10 year and 20 year design periods respectively.

The construction cost of pavement with subgrade CBR values as 7% are given in TABLE FIVE 10. TABLE-FIVE 11 & 12 give the cost comparison between the two

months for 10 and 20 year design period respectively,
for the subgrade CBR values of 7%.

This shows that the Asphalt concrete surfacing is
more economical of the two methods.

TABLE-1
TRAFFIC DATA AND PROJECTION

	1977						2982					
	Non Moto- rized	Motor Cycle and Cars	Mini Bus	Bus	Truck	Total Moto- rized	Non Moto- rized	Motor Cycle and Cars	Mini Bus	Bus	Truck	Total motorized
Lahore-Bhai Pheru.	450	621	42	794	1521	2978	561	1693	98	2029	4690	8510
Bhai Pheru- Pattoki	453	499	30	782	1491	2802	1152	1317	70	2301	5276	8964
Pattoki-Okara	711	550	67	804	1417	2838	1174	1168	157	2117	4001	7443
Okara-Sahiwal	1456	421	53	620	1001	2095	1978	871	121	1416	1888	4296
Sahiwal- Chichawatni	632	442	74	583	921	2020	784	1042	173	1155	1656	4026
Chichawatni- Khanewal	707	762	21	386	734	1908	827	1510	48	765	1387	3710

TABLE FIVE-2

Paper No. 455

VEHICLE USER COSTSLAHORE -MULTAN ROAD

Design period 10 years.

Vehicle	Cost per 1000 Kms in Rupees				Link Distance 000 Kms Annual	AADT Vehicles 000	Total Cost Million Rs. Col.5x6x7	
	Fuel	Depre- ciation	Interest	Time				Total Col. 1 to 4
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
<u>COST DUE TO OVERLAY DISTURBANCE</u>								
Car	130.84	271.68	364.31	1070	1836.83	.411	.530	.400
Mini-Bus	111.77	297.51	167.09	2990	3566.37	"	.074	.108
Bus	244.89	644.23	319.60	4260	5468.72	"	.984	2.212
Truck	301.97	382.10	265.09	680	1629.16	"	1.77	1.185
<u>COST WITHOUT OVERLAY DISTURBANCE</u>								
Car	122.35	121.24	88.63	530	862.22	.411	.530	.188
Mini-Bus	110.97	75.44	47.27	920	1153.68	"	.074	.035
Bus	237.67	174.71	85.61	1720	2217.99	"	.984	.897
Truck	225.92	114.63	86.67	260	687.22	"	1.770	.500

E.I. Johri

TABLE FIVE-3VEHICLE USER COSTSLAHORE - MULTAN ROADDESIGN PERIOD - 20 YEARS

Vehicle	<u>Cost per 1000 Kms in Rupees</u>				Total Col. 2 to 5	Link Dis- tance 000 Kms Annual	AADT Vehicles 000	Total Cost Million Rs. Col. 7 x 8 x 9
	Fuel	Description	Interest	Time				
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
<u>Cost Due to Overlay Disturbance in 1992</u>								
Car	137.20	271.68	364.31	1070	1843.19	.411	.761	0.576
Mini-Bus	121.09	297.51	167.09	2990	3575.69	.411	.111	0.163
Bus	265.30	644.23	319.60	4260	5489.13	.411	1.631	3.680
Truck	327.13	382.10	265.09	680	1654.32	.411	3.150	2.142
<u>Cost without Overlay Disturbance in 1992</u>								
Car	112.35	152.14	120.50	710	1094.99	.411	.761	0.342
Mini-Bus	98.63	97.75	57.16	1220	1473.54	.411	.111	0.067
Bus	219.87	245.68	117.00	2400	2982.55	.411	1.631	1.999
Truck	268.05	162.39	109.61	350	890.05	.411	3.150	1.152

TABLE FIVE-4COMPARATIVE VEHICLE-USER-COST DUE TO OVERLAY DISTURBANCE

(Rs. in million)

	With Overlay	Without Overlay	Additional vehicle-user-cost due to Overlay
Car	0.400	.188	.212
Mini Bus	0.108	.035	.073
Bus	2.212	.897	1.315
Truck	1.185	.500	.685
		Total:	Rs. 2.285 million

Total length of Project = 267 Km

Cost per Kilometer = $\frac{2285}{267}$ = Rs. 8600 or 8.6 in (000)

TABLE FIVE-5COMPARATIVE VEHICLE USER COST OF OVERLAY DISTURBANCE

Design Period = 20 years

Figure in (000)

Vehicle	With Overlay	Without Overlay	Net Additional Cost in case of Overlay
Car	576.0	342.0	234.0
Mini-Bus	163.0	67.0	96.0
Bus	3680.0	1999.0	1681.0
Truck	2142.0	1152.0	990.0
		Total:	3001.0

Total Length of Project = 267 Kms

$$\text{Cost per Kilometer} = \frac{3001}{267} = \text{Rs. } 11.24 \text{ (000)}$$

TABLE FIVE-6

ADDITIONAL STOPPAGE TIME-COST DUE TO OVERLAY

Design Period = 10 Years

1	2	3	Figure in Million		
			4	5	6
	Time value for vehicle passenger & Crew per Minute.	Total Time stoppage at 3 links (20 minutes.)	Total Vehi- cle.	Overlay Constru- ction period days.	Total Cost 2x3x4
Car	1.57	31.40	530	273	4.55
Mini Bus	1.01	20.20	074	273	0.41
Bus	1.55	31.00	084	273	8.33
Truck	0.26	5.20	1770	273	2.51
					<u>15.80</u>

Total cost per kilometer = $\frac{15800}{267}$ = Rs. 59.18

Vehicle Users X Cost from Table-4 = 8.60
 Cost X Net Cost = Rs. 67.78
 or = Rs. 67.8 (000)

Link	Period in year	Net Cost	Escalated at 15%	Discounted at 12%
Lahore-Bhai Pheru	3	67.8	103.1	73.4
Bhaipheru-Pattoki	3	67.8	103.1	73.4
Pattoki-Okara	4	67.8	118.6	75.4
Okara-Sahawal	6	67.8	156.8	79.5
Sahawal-Chichawatni	6	67.8	156.8	78.5
Chichawatni- Khanewal	7	67.8	180.3	81.6

Assuming 9 months construction period and 20 minutes stoppage at the 3 links where overlay is in operation.

TABLE FIVE-7

ADDITIONAL STOPPAGE TIME COST IN CASE
OF OVERLAY

Design Period = 20 years

Fig. (000)

Vehicle	Time value for vehicle Passenger & Crew per Minute.	Total Time value stopp- age at 3 link (20 Minute)	Total Vehi- cles.	Overlay Construc- tion Period Days.	Total Cost (000) (3x4x5)
1	2	3	4	5	6
Car	1.57	31.40	761	273	6523.4
Mini-Bus	1.01	20.20	111	273	612.1
Bus	1.55	31.00	1631	273	13803.2
Truck	0.26	5.20	3150	273	4471.7
					25410.4

Total time value cost per kilometer = $\frac{25410}{267} = 95.17$

Total disturbance cost per Kilometer
from Table-5 = 11.24

Net Cost = 106.41

Upto 1997 add for 15% escalation, Cost/km = 865.86

Discount at 12% Cost/Km. = 158.00

Assuming 9 months construction period and 20 minutes total
stoppage at the 3 links where overlay is in operation.

TABLE FIVE-8

Paper No. 455

ECONOMIC STUDY FOR PAVEMENT DESIGNDesign for 10 Years

Sub-grade CBR = 3%

(Figures in '000')

Link	T.S.T. cost in 1982 per Km.	T.S.T. Overlay cost after passing three million Axles (cost per Km)	Additional cost due to traffic disruption per Kilometer	T.S.T. cost per Km Present worth.	Asphalt Concrete cost per Km present worth.	Remarks
Lahore-Bhai Pheru.	1431.3	256.9	73.4	1761.6	1688.8	Asphalt Concrete Surfacing is economical.
Bhai Pheru-Pattoki	1431.3	269.6	73.4	1774.3	1688.8	"
Pattoki-Okara	1431.3	237.5	75.4	1744.2	1688.8	"
Okara -Sahiwal	1431.3	208.6	79.5	1719.4	1496.7	"
Sahiwal-Chichawatni	1431.3	208.6	79.5	1719.4	1496.7	"
Chichawatni-Khanewal	1431.3	213.9	81.6	1726.8	1319.6	"

E.I. Johri

TABLE FIVE-9

ECONOMIC STUDY FOR PAVEMENT DESIGN

DESIGN FOR 20 YEARS

Fig. in (000)

SUB- GRADE C.B.R. = 3%

	T.S.T. (1st Year) Pavement				A/C (1st Year) Pavement			Remarks
	1st Year Cost in 1982 per Km + Overlay cost after passing 3 million Axles.	Overlay cost in 1992	Additional cost due to traffic disruption per kilometer in case of Surfacing in 1997	Total cost per Km.	1st Year cost.	Asphalt Overlay in 1992 per Km.	Total cost (Present worth)	
Lahore-Bhaipheru	1761.6	293.5	-	2055.1	1688.8	293.5	1982.3	Asphalt Concrete Surfacing is economical
Bhaipheru-Pattoki	1774.3	324.4	-	2098.7	1688.8	310.0	1998.8	
Pattoki-Okara	1744.2	247.1	-	1991.3	1688.8	262.6	1951.4	
Okara-Sahiwal	1719.4	231.7	-	1951.1	1496.7	231.7	1728.4	
Sahiwal-Chichawatni	1719.4	231.7	-	1951.1	1496.7	231.7	1728.4	
Chichawatni-Khanewal	1726.8	a 89.9			1319.6	231.7	1551.3	
		b 102.75	158	2077.95				

a- Surfacing in 1992

b- Surfacing in 1997

TABLE FIVE-10

Paper No. 455

COST OF CONSTRUCTION/KILOMETER

(SUB GRADE C.B.R. = 7%)

SECTION	A/C IST YEAR COST.	T.S.T. PLUS ASPHALT OVERLAY			OVERLAY COST FOR NEXT 10 YEARS	
		Ist. Year Cost.	For 3x106 AXLE Overlay Period	Passing Cost of Overlay	A/C(Initial surfacing).	TST(Initial Surfacing)
Lahore-Bhaipheru	1,154,779	930,806	3 years	201,603	177,885	189,744
Bhaipheru-Pattoki	1,54,779	930,806	3½ years	213,462	177,885	189,744
Pattoki-Okara	1,154,779	930,806	4 years	177,885	177,885	177,885
Okara-Sahiwal	1,047,306	930,806	6 years	177,885	177,885	177,885
Sahiwal- Chichawatni.	1,047,306	930,806	7½ years	177,885	177,885	* -

* T.S.T. Surfacing shall be done in 1992 & 1997, at a cost of Rs.61,754 per surfacing.

(continued)