

Paper No. 678

**SUSTAINABLE PAKISTAN THROUGH MATCHING
GRANT PROGRAMME: 21ST CENTURY VISION**

Qamar-ul-Islam, Dr. Awais Piracha, Muhammad Shahzad

SUSTAINABLE PAKISTAN THROUGH MATCHING GRANT PROGRAMME: 21ST CENTURY VISION

Qamar-ul-Islam¹ Dr. Awais Piracha², Muhammad Shahzad³

ABSTRACT

With reference to 68th Annual session of Pakistan Engineering Congress (PEC) was held on 19th January 2001 at Lahore, the chief guest of the conference, the Chairman of National Reconstruction Bureau (NRB) of Pakistan announced the replication of Matching Grants (MG) program for 21st Century through Citizen Community Boards (CCBs) in all over Pakistan.

After a considerable period of three years even today MG program is running in villages, towns and cities of Pakistan under more than 20 thousands CCBs. Millions of the people of various districts of this country are benefiting from the community based sustainable projects.

It is concluded that Engineering Congress has also played a significant role because (1) it provided the platform where the program was introduced all over the country. (2) Secondly this platform also provided the opportunities to the engineers, planners, architects and citizens of the country to build the nation together. As the consequences of this joint efforts to build the nation together has been seen at various tehsils and districts, where the engineers, planners, architects and citizens have started to understand each other and work together for sustainable Pakistan.

21st Century Matching Grant Program in the light of Iqbal's characteristics for sustainable Pakistan has been conceived. Thus the program has been reviewed and analysed through 9 criteria of Iqbal's thoughts which lead towards sustainable Pakistan.

¹ Professor in City & Regional Planning Department, University of Engineering & Technology, Lahore, PAKISTAN. Email: qamar49@hotmail.com

² Lecturer Planning, School of Construction , Property & Planning, University of Western Sydney, Blacktown Campus, Penrith South DC NSW 1797 AUSTRALIA. Email: a.piracha@uws.edu.au

³ Ph.D scholar, Department of Mechanical Engineering, University of Engineering & Technology, Lahore, PAKISTAN.

BACKGROUND

This research paper will represent a long experience of the researcher towards silver jubilee of Matching Grant (MG) Program in comparison to Member Provincial (MP) Assembly's Programs implemented during 1980-2005 in rural Punjab, Pakistan. Particularly in the 1980s there were some issues related to find out appropriate approaches to rural development in third world countries including rural Pakistan as one of them. A first incomplete study ended in mid 1990s while the programs mentioned above remained continued and thus the 20th century also ended.

Regarding Rural Development (RD) programs a doctoral study in the early 21st century by the researcher s invited many issues to be resolved. A comprehensive data of total 52,109 RD projects implemented in 31 districts of rural Punjab in their life time from 1980 to 2000 was collected and which has been comparatively analyzed with particular reference to MG and MP types and 6 categories of projects.

The major objective of these efforts has been to explore the most effective RD program of 20th century to be presented to the government and if justified it should be replicated onward in the 21st century for whole Pakistan. Results from 20 years data have shown, MG program has been more effective due to more projects, more cost effectiveness, popularity and above all sustainable under the local communities. These results convinced the federal government and National Reconstruction Bureau (NRB) decided to replicate MG program in all villages, towns and cities of Pakistan.

It was the Pakistan Engineering Congress which first time provided opportunity to the Federal level government to announce replication of MG through the reference of Local Government Ordinance-2001. Since 14th August 2001, MG program has been decentralized and institutionalized at three levels. The program under the new devolution plan is being run under the mutual consultations of registered Citizen Community Boards (CCBs) and respective local government offices. On the other hand in the absence of policy guidelines and lack of MPAs interests, MP program has become a rolling stone among the old and new institutions.

MG VS MP PROGRAMS IN THE 21st CENTURY

During the life time of these programs the researchers have been keenly interested to collect data of the projects under these programs, observed and noted down important events, changes, ups and downs. Various presentations based on MG versus MP projects and their effects were presented in particular to newly developed National Bureau of Reconstruction (NRB) of Pakistan. Based on the research and partial analysis MG program seemed better and with more effective approach. These efforts by the researcher to the high officials and decision makers

for the future of rural development in the 21st century convinced for the replication of MG program under new institutions in Pakistan.

A new era of MG program has been started since 2001. With the arrival of new government under General Parvez Musharaf, it decided to replicate MG program through new devolution plan in Pakistan. Thus MG program was institutionalized since 14th August 2001 under the Local Government Ordinance-2001. In order to run this program under new institutions section 98 on Citizen Community Boards (CCBs) and section 119 on Matching Grants (with 20% self help) and 80% government sharing are the new policies of Ordinance. MG program has been launched in all villages, towns and cities of all provinces in Pakistan. Up till now a lot of amendments have been inserted in the present local government ordinance.

Up till now MG program has completed its quarter century (Silver Jubilee) in rural Punjab of Pakistan as indicated by a comprehensive study based on quarter century starting 1980 to 2005.

So far the MP program is concerned, it is floating between old Assistant Directors of Local Government (ADLGs) and new system under Nazims. More over the so called ADLGs of the old structure of local government and the officials in new institutions are no longer responsible for MP program nor any reasonable interest has been retained by the MPAs in their constituencies.

ANALYSIS

Table -1 shows in the year 2000 a total reached to a figure of 52,109 projects in which 30,820 (59%) and 21,289 (41%) represent MG and MP projects respectively.

Table-1: Distribution of projects by types and average cost (1981-2000)

Level of Research	Decades (Years)	Project Types		Total projects
		MG Type	MP type	
1st phase Research on 1980s (i) Approaches to rural development (1980-1990)	1st Decade (1981-1990)	22,059 56% projects (72%) Total cost=Rs 1536.82 million Ave cost=Rs. 69,669.00/project	17,354 44% projects (79%) Total cost= Rs 2171.00 million Ave cost=Rs. 128,154.00/project	39,413 100% projects (76%) Total cost=Rs 3703.82 million Ave cost=Rs. 93,975.00/project
	2nd Decade (1991-2000)	8761 69% projects (28 %) Total cost= Rs 960.93 million Ave cost=Rs. 109,682.00/project	3935 31% projects (21%) Total cost= Rs 851.31 million Ave cost=Rs. 216,343.00/project	12,696 100% projects (24%) Total cost= Rs 1812.24 million Ave cost=Rs.142,741.00/project
2nd phase Level Research on (i) Effective RD Programs MG Vs MP (1980-2000) (ii) Replication of MG- Local Govt Ordinance-2001 (2001-2005 & onward)	All Decades (1981-2000)	30,820 59% projects (100 %) Total cost= Rs 2497.75 million Ave cost=Rs. 81,043.00/project	21,289 41% projects (100%) Total cost= Rs 3022.31 million Ave cost=Rs. 141,966.00/project	52,109 100% projects (100%) Total cost= Rs 5520.06 million Ave cost=Rs.105,933.00/project

Chi Sq= 65.792 DF=1 p=0.000

Source: Survey and analysis by the author (2003-2004)

Later table-2 showed the long run impact- sustained by MG and MP projects in later part of this research. It further showed success of these projects which were sustained and upgraded. These results have been deducted after the completion of two decades comparative study (see table-3). Moreover the new institutional set ups have been framed for running participatory Matching Grants program in 21st century.

Table-2: Sustenance of all projects in Punjab by type of projects (Punjab: 1981-2000)

Sustenance	MG projects	MP projects	Total
In service (Sustained)	24422 (71%) 79%	9762 (29%) 46%	34184 (100%) 66%
Out of service (Not sustained)	6398 (36%) 21%	11527 (64%) 54%	17925 (100%) 34%
Total	30820 (59%) 100%	21289 (41%) 100%	52109 (100%) 100%
Chi Square= 589.615 DF= 1 p-value=0.000			

Source: *All doctoral level data and analysis

Table-3: Up gradation of all projects in Punjab by type of projects (Punjab: 1981-2000)

Sustenance	MG projects	MP projects	Total
Up graded	12589 (81%) 41%	2908 (19%) 14%	15497 (100%) 30%
Not up graded	18231 (49%) 59%	18381 (51%) 86%	36612(100%) 70%
Total	30820 (59%) 100%	21289 (41%) 100%	52109 (100%) 100%
Chi Square= 549.496 DF= 1 p-value=0.000			

Source: *All doctoral level data and analysis

REPLICATION OF MATCHING GRANTS PROGRAMME IN 21ST CENTURY

Results deducted from the literature review and evidences of this research work in the light of above objectives and presentations to the Chairmen (General Naqvi then Daniyal Aziz) of National Reconstruction Bureau (NRB) of Pakistan have proved that the most effective RD programme of 20th century in Pakistan has been MG. Moreover as the results of recent continuous efforts by the researcher, and other experts, National Reconstruction Bureau (NRB) has recognised this programme as the need of present socio-economic circumstances. Following events with reference to the Chairmen, NRB are worth to represent here:

On 19th January 2001 in the 68th Annual Session of Pakistan Engineering Congress (PEC) , Inaugural Session was held. As the Chief Guest, General Naqvi, Chairman, NRB of Pakistan, stated:

“There is only one method and that is they raise money, support money with money or what ever from the people, put that to the table, ask for the Matching Grant (MG), get the matching grants, creates more and more

projects, then small projects getting done and the people what have given can see that here is the money given and here is job that was done. This brings me the connections and that is where ever there is a project that has to be engineers and this is kind of mass activity that will be generated, more energy is released, more money released, more projects are therefore released and more engineers are employed and this kind of the thing which can produce more jobs..... This system tends to encourage such people to come forward.”
[Source: Video film is available from the researcher-Qamar-ul-Islam]

However the researcher’s various research papers particularly two published in (1994, 1997) local news papers in the national language and focussing on *comparison of MG and MP projects*, their macro and micro analysis and critical reviews attracted various experts notably Mr Iltaf H Mashwani from NWFP province, Dr. A Rahim senior UNDP expert, Mr Naeem from Local Government , Katchi Abady wing, Mr. Liaqat, Mr. Amin, Town Planners from Kasur and Sheikhpura, K Islam from Lahore, Mr Shakir and Mr. Ijaz from City and Regional Planning Department, Professor Dr. Ijaz A Choudhary from Engineering University, Lahore and many people from villages, towns and cities of Pakistan. Having read these local articles these people also contacted Chairman NRB and demanded to declare Matching Grant Programme to be implemented in 21st century in all areas of Pakistan.

Second time on 1st March 2001 in the Seminar on “Role of Town Planners in the Devolution Plan in Pakistan” held by City and Regional Planning Department, the Chairman (NRB) of Pakistan, also highlighted the reliability and validity of Matching Grant Programme mainly by the commitments of the local leaders and participation of local people with honesty and devotion.

Third time on March 26, 2001 in the International Conference on “Geographic Information Technology for Environmental Governance, Urban Management and Rural Development” was held in Barki, Lahore, where the Chairman NRB admitted “*whole matching grant programme*” as the ultimate solution for the rural as well as urban development for sustainable Pakistan in many aspects.

Eventually the federal cabinet at NRB Centre finally discussed and admitted **Bottom up planning approach deducted from Matching Grant Programme** as the most effective one for the implementation and sustainability of **Matching Grant Programme of 21st century** for all areas of Pakistan.

21ST CENTURY MG PROGRAM IN THE LIGHT OF IQBAL’S THOUGHTS FOR SUSTAINABLE PAKISTAN

Iqbal enlightens us various characteristics regarding development of Metaphysics among the sufies in Iran and subcontinent. Western and many eastern scholars explore the realities of many things in this (material) world by virtue of material science and omit or neglect the reality of other important world which has been pointed out by Iqbal many ways. Concerning to our subject Iqbal’s thoughts on metaphysics represent two major aspects, (1) physical existence (the existence of material world), (2) spiritual reality (the spiritual world which is eternal). Iqbal’s

spectrum of visions for the development and its relevance to the human beings particularly for sustainable development exists in these important aspects which are much wider and complete as compared to the limited thoughts of those development planners who presented rural development programmes under top down approach. Iqbal studies these aspects in depths and in both of these worlds. Iqbal seeks guidelines in these perspectives where as other scholars are confined in material perspectives of the things.

Top-down and Bottom-up approaches have been based on the physical and performance criteria by various researchers which are appreciable but at the same time they have not realized the local conditions and eastern culture and spiritual values which are very important from Iqbal's points of views. What were the Iqbal's thoughts for the sustainable development programme?

CHARACTERISTICS OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMS RELEVANT TO IQBAL'S THOUGHTS

The authors have worked out and explored the most important characteristics from Iqbal's work which in fact makes the approach and the program most effective and sustainable in the local culture. Iqbal learnt from Quran that the approach to development which comes from the bottom (from all general people) gives the opportunity to the people to decide mutually and honestly with the collective wisdom [Read sura alshura from Quran]. Iqbal has elaborated this approach with different aspects and phases and stages for the development of programmes and their sustainable impacts. The researcher has collected those elements and put them in a systematic manner to give real meaning of his suggested approach as he stressed for (i) mutual consultations (ii) Mutual participation (iii) and mutual benefits. Iqbal further adds that if this process is adopted than the sustainability of projects and programme can be achieved.

Thus Iqbal's source of inspiration and guidelines are different from the western world philosophers mentioned above. castes. The author has explored nine characteristics from his treatise which are relevant to this philosopher of the east for making rural development programme most effective and sustainable in the local conditions of eastern culture and socio-economic life of masses living in various regions. These characteristics one by one are elaborated here:

(1) Bottom-up approach to rural development

In a broad sense Iqbal has various sub disciplines in his major disciplines of rich literature and philosophies and moreover he was also deep for the studies for human beings and their settlements. In the words of Professor Munawar:

"His range of interests covered Religion, Philosophy, Art, Politics, Economics, Nationalism, the revival of Muslim life and the universal brotherhood of man." [Iqbal quoted by Munawar:1986, p.2].

The researcher now adds into it another discipline of human settlements and rural development in the Asian countries. During 20th century Iqbal has shown us experiences of two major approaches to rural development in the subcontinent. One

is called “Top down” government exogenous (Badesi) type approach to development from the top officers without the involvement of people. The other approach is participatory and its other name is Bottom up endogenous (desi) approach towards decision making, implementations and maintenance of RD projects by the local people.

Top-down approach to development remained dominant most of the time in the 20th century by virtue of our foreign aid under different names of rural development programmes. On the other hand many researchers notably Inayat Ullah (1960), Islam (1981) and Gelani (1998) have reached to the conclusion that Iqbal always encouraged people to participate in their matter for development from bottom levels in villages, towns and cities. [Source: see in video film Professor Gelani’s lecture on **top down and bottom up approaches 1998**]

(2) Endogenous

As discussed above 20th century saw two major approaches, ‘**top down**’ was an exogenous (badesi) in nature and ‘**bottom up**’ (desi) was endogenous type. Iqbal’s self insists to develop one’s own approach to development as it is relevant to the local conditions and local culture and society. The Asians who have their own established cultures and socio-economic systems. Therefore approaches to development enforced by the powerful and rich countries cannot represent the local people and it may affect their development.

(3) Ownership incentives

Iqbal did realize the miserable living conditions of the local people in the towns, the poor and land less peasants in the rural landscapes which were also due to unjustified land subdivisions by the colonial commissioners and deputy commissioners in various districts. Iqbal clearly explained the low level profile of socio-economic and living conditions of a representative Muslim community:

“I am sure nobody will deny that the economic condition of the average Muslam is extremely deplorable. His small wage, dirty house, and under-fed children are a matter of common observation in the towns where the population is mostly Muslaims. Inside these unhappy dwelling there are hundreds of men and women whose fathers have seen better days, but who are now compelled to starve .” [Iqbal quoted and Ed by Sherwani.: p,136].

Large chunks of lands were allocated to the landlords in the rural areas with the consequences that the peasants were subject to aliens to their landlords. Iqbal wanted the ownership rights to every class and castes in the villages otherwise he was inspired to open a revolutionary campaign against the feudal lords generated by the Royal empire in the Muslam land:

“Get up! Go and wake the poor of my World.

Upset the foundations of the Houses of Lords”

[Source: Iqbal quoted and translated by M.Y. Mirza:1991, p70].

(4) Programme Relevance to women

In the development context women have been given due respect and significance by Iqbal. In her limits she can trade, study and deals her socio-economic activities in honor and dignity which the prophet of Islam has given her. For Iqbal:

“The woman is predominantly the creative element in life, and all creative forces in nature are hidden.” [Source: Iqbal quoted and edited by Sherwani: 1944, 1995 p.192].

It has been a record that in the matching grant programme in 1980s women participated in 30,820 projects because most of the rural development projects (RD) were also relevant to them, their children. Women worked for the benefits of whole household members. Thus Iqbal is very right to claim that half of this human force cannot be ignored in the development programmes. In his views men and women are integrated to make the success of rural development programmes in Asian regions.

(5) Beneficiary classes

Participation is the responses of mutual consultations and those who participated they also get benefits. Iqbal advocates pluralistic planning for the benefits of masses, all classes and castes. For example in addition to the stresses on the development of education from grass roots level for useful education for all:

“Mass education is absolutely essential in the interest of people. Primary education, secondary education, professional or vocational education are all various aspects of the same problem of mass education [quoted and edited by Sherwani :1944, 1995, p.52].

(6) Self government

Iqbal pointed out that the western democracy was not qualitative in it's nature and hence it was not suitable for third world but we committed the same mistakes under the super powers of the world as our compulsions with the bad consequences. Iqbal wanted islamic democracy from grass roots level. In various writings and speeches Iqbal showed the ways of government from the grass roots level. He wished that in the subcontinent local government should have established where the representatives of the local people could work for the people in the easy locations and in their vicinities. But the colonial era was well established with their capital characteristics as he stated:

*“You have been devoured by the cunning Capitalist,
Your fate stays hung for centuries in the balance.”
[Iqbal translated by Mirza:1991, p.96]*

However by “self government” he meant ultimately local government system under the local government acts but without the dominance of the colonial

(commissioner system) administrative power and dominance in Punjab, NWFP, Sind and Baluchistan as he wanted:

"I would like to see the Punjab, North Frontier Province, Sind and Baluchistan into a single state. Self-Government without the British Empire."
[Iqbal: 1930, Allahbad Session].

The researchers have further elevated the local government concept of Iqbal into practical shape. At every union council level there will be a comprehensive development programme which will be executed by the local government and the local people. The researcher has recently given it the name "Mairy basti mairy janat". This programme will be financed under the Matching Grant as the government has already committed for the development of such projects, see in Local Government Ordinance 2001.

Similarly in the villages "Maira gaun mairy janat" will be executed with the help of "Matching Grant" under the bottom up approach. In fact these will be the further outcomes of this research in this 21st century. But yet "Mairy basti mairy janat" or "Maira gaun mairy janat" under the same bottom up approach of Matching Grant have to be started in the mountainous and desert areas of Pakistan.

(7) Cultural and spiritual values

Iqbal understands that we need material world to live in but it would give us material satisfaction which will be insufficient and ineffective to resolve our lot of problems. He reminds us the good aspects of our religion and culture by virtue of spiritual aspects and their everlasting effects. He suggests:

"Pass from matter to spirit. Matter is diversity: spirit is light, life and unity." [Iqbal quoted by Inayatullah: No date, p.10].

Moreover in the words of Dr. Annemarie Schimmel:

"Iqbal is the spiritual axis of Pakistan." [Iqbal quoted by Anayatullah, p12].

(8) Generation of self reliance

It has already been discussed that an approach and the programme originated from the people themselves according to the local socio-economic and climatic conditions and more over without exogenous (foreign aid and superimposed conditions) powers can generate self reliance on the long run. Ultimately Iqbal wanted to generate the self reliance among his people for the development process without any compromise on the sovereignty of their land and government.

(9) Sustenance of projects

It is well known that the self helped projects are well repaired and maintained by their makers in the local areas because of ownership incentives. Iqbal shows us broader perspective of sustainable development. He discusses on the development of metaphysics and associate development in the material as well as in the spiritual world. In his words:

"Come if thou would'st know the secret of everlasting life!"

Come, if thou would'st win both heaven and earth!."

[Iqbal translated by Dar:1962,1981: p21].

In the material world our sustainability as mentioned hundreds of researchers refer to physical development by physical existence or by physical performance in the environment.

The outcome from the analysis with reference to Iqbal's thoughts.

From the analysis (1) with reference to Iqbal's thoughts (2) and from their ranking for replicability in the 21st century, RD programmes including Matching Grant Programme have shown us the most effective and sustainable. Its characteristics which lead towards sustainable development in the light of Iqbal have shown us the facts in the 20th century and as well as in the 21st century. For Iqbal *sustainable rural development is endogenous and self reliant, self financed socio-economic process built on the strength, endowments and previous accomplishment of a society* and we have found these elements in the recent MG Program.

Comprehensive study of the researchers have shown that after a lot of ups and downs MG program was again replicated and then it has completed its silver jubilee from year 1980 to 2005. Now how MG program is functioning and what types of new challenges and amendments in the CCB and Matching Grant acts in sections 98 and 119 are being taken, all have been diverted to another doctoral thesis taken up by Sara Khan and other researchers. On the other hand MP program has come to an end and there is no proper efforts or interest among MPAs, ADLGs and new institutions in Pakistan.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Ahmad, Absar (1986) *The Concept of Self : and Self Identity in Contemporary Philosophy* Iqbal Academy, Lahore.

Dar.M.A.M (translated for Luce-Claude:1962,1981) Introduction to the Thought of Iqbal

Iqbal_Academy, 116 Mcleod Road Lahore.

Government of Pakistan (2001) The Sind Baluchistan NWFP and Punjab Local Government Ordinance-2001, National Reconstruction Bureau, Islamabad.

Government of Punjab (1990), Tamir-i-Watan Programme., Lahore.

Gupta. Anil K, Ed (2001) Criteria and Indicators of Sustainability in Rural Development Oxford and IBH Publishing Co. Pvt. Ltd, New Delhi, Calcutta.

Iqbal, Allama Muhammad (1903) Ilmul Iqtasad Ainae Adab, Chowk Menar, Anarkali, Lahore.

Iqbal, Allama Muhammad (No date) Development of Metaphysics in Persia A Ph..D. thesis by Iqbal Munich University, published in London.

Iqbal, Allama Muhammad (1996) The Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam, Sange meel publications, Lahore.

Lowett, E.W (1980): Ph.D. Thesis, Pub 29-4882 by School of Oriental and African Studies, University London. Title: "*The Integrated Rural Development Programme Of Pakistan: An Evaluation.*"

Mirza.M.Yaqoob (Translated for Iqbal:1991) A Selection and Translation of Iqbaliat Iqbal Academy, Lahore.

Munawar, Muhammad (1986, 1996) Dimensions of Iqbal Iqbal Academy, Lahore.

Umar, Suheyl Muhammad Ed (1999) Iqbal Review Journal published by Iqbal Academy Pakistan, Lahore.

Government of Punjab (2001) The Punjab Local Government Ordinance (XIII of 2001)

Government of Punjab (1990), Tamir-i-Watan Programme., Lahore.

Gupta. Anil K, Ed (2001) Criteria and Indicators of Sustainability in Rural Development Oxford and IBH Publishing Co. Pvt. Ltd, New Delhi, Calcutta.

Operations Evaluation Department of World Bank (1990) The Aga Khan Rural Support Programme in Pakistan, Washington, D.C.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This research paper has been based on the doctoral research work of major researcher (Qamar-ul-Islam). The researcher is thankful to the supervisors who suggested to write this paper to present in 70th Annual session of Pakistan Engineering Congress at Lahore. Prof Dr Uzair from Mathematics Dept of UET helped in Chi square methods for significance tests. Dr Piracha appreciated the data analysis and presentation at AIT, Thailand. Mr. Shahzad has been a great help to me during my stay at Edinburgh Universities in Scotland, AIT in Thailand and UET in Pakistan.

